

THE HONG KONG HOUSING AUTHORITY

Memorandum for the Building Committee

Appointment of Engineering Consultant for Structural Design and Production of Drawings for The Proposed New HOS Blocks, Scheme 1, Variations C & D

(Agreement No. CRB/S/2000/8)

PURPOSE

This paper seeks Members' approval to the appointment of Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited for the structural design and production of drawings for the proposed New HOS Blocks, Scheme 1, Variations C & D.

BACKGROUND

2. The development of design for new standard blocks based on a 10 flats per floor flexible modular block design to replace the existing New Cruciform Block was approved by the Building Committee on 19 October 2000 (Paper No. BC 154/2000, QH 20/2000).

3. Due to the shortage of in-house staff resources, coupled with the tight programme to meet the foundation contract tender-out date in April 2001 for the first project adopting these new standard blocks, the Department has arranged to employ consultants to undertake the structural design and production of drawings for the blocks. An Assessment Panel has also been set up for the selection exercise.

THE SELECTION

4. The two-envelope system was used and the selection was carried out in two stages. Under Stage 1, consultants on the Architectural and Associated Consultants Selection Board's "List of Structural Engineering Consultants" were

invited to express interest. 11 submissions were received by the closing date of 9 November 2000. Nine consultants were shortlisted based on the shortlisting criteria approved by the Assessment Panel before the closing date.

5. In the Stage 2, the nine shortlisted consultants were invited to submit Technical and Fee Proposals. Submissions from them were received by the closing date of 1 December 2000. The Technical Proposals were assessed by the Assessment Panel. A weighting of 70/30 for Technical and Fee Scores was adopted. The summary of the combined Technical and Fee Scores is tabulated at **Annex A**.

DETAILED ASSESSMENT

6. Wong & Cheng Consulting Engineers Limited (Wong & Cheng) obtained the highest combined score. They had the highest technical score but they offered a fee substantially higher than those offered by other consultants. Their proposed fee of \$3.80M was higher than our estimate of \$2.0M and the average fee submitted by all the consultants at \$1.74M by 90% and 118% respectively.

7. Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited (Ove Arup) obtained the second highest combined score. They scored the second highest in their technical submission and their submitted fee of \$1.68M is comparable to our estimate of \$2.0M and the average fee of \$1.74M submitted by all the consultants.

8. The performance scores of both Wong & Cheng and Ove Arup are similar and within the same band.

9. In view of Wong & Cheng's unreasonably high bid, the Assessment Panel considers it unjustifiable to offer the appointment to them. The Panel recommends that Ove Arup be appointed as the consultant for the structural design of the New HOS Blocks, as there is no question about their technical capability and their fee is reasonable as compared with our estimate. The recommendation represents good value for money.

FUNDING ARRANGEMENT

10. Funds are available for the consultancy fee of \$1.68M.

RECOMMENDATION

11. We recommend that Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited be appointed for the structural design and production of drawings for the proposed New HOS Blocks, Scheme 1, Variations C & D.

PRESUMPTION

12. It is thought that Members will not object to the recommendation in paragraph 11 above. If no objection or request for discussion is received by the Committees' Secretary **by noon on 3 January 2001**, Members' approval will be presumed.

---0---0---0---

Miss Ivy LEONG
Secretary, Building Committee
Tel. No. : 2761 5033
Fax No. : 2761 0019

File Ref. : HD(SE) 310/1/10

Date : 22 December 2000